

TO: Ivan Montiel, Baruch College, City University of New York, Chair, ONE Division

FROM: Ingrid Fulmer, Rutgers University
Chair, Division and Interest Group Relations (DIGR) Committee
BOG Representative at Large

CC: DIGR Committee Members:
Amy Hillman, Arizona State University (BOG President-Elect)
Sabine Hoidn, University of St. Gallen (Past Division Chair, Management, Education and Development Division)
Keld Laursen, Copenhagen Business School (BOG Representative at Large)
Isabel Metz, Melbourne Business School, University of Melbourne (BOG Representative at Large)
Amy E. Smith, University of Massachusetts, Boston (Past Division Chair, Public & Nonprofit Division)

DATE: 1 June 2022

RE: Feedback on Organizations and Natural Environment (ONE) Division's 5 Year Report

Congratulations! On behalf of the Academy of Management Board, I am happy to report that the Organizations and Natural Environment (ONE) Division has been renewed for another five years. The committee found your report to be thorough and well-developed; the committee also appreciated the division's specific goals and initiatives. We know that your leadership team worked hard over the last year to produce the report. We appreciate the time and energy your team invested.

After reviewing your report and the accompanying data, the DIGR committee members identified strengths and concerns going forward, and assessed the efforts underway to lesson any concerns, all of which are summarized below. In addition, we offer recommendations for building on the division's strengths and continuing to provide valuable services to your members. Many of these issues and actions were identified in the report, although some were identified by the DIGR committee. We hope that our feedback will enable you to leverage the division's strengths and advance our shared goal of strengthening and invigorating the Academy of Management.

Please recall that an important element of the review process is for division leaders to share the report and review results in an open letter to their membership, via the website or email.

In addition, if you are interested, we would welcome the opportunity to meet with your leadership team virtually to recognize your accomplishments, answer any questions, and discuss any concerns.

Academy of Management

***Vision:** We inspire and enable a better world through our scholarship and teaching about management and organizations.
Mission: To build a vibrant and supportive community of scholars by markedly expanding opportunities to connect and explore ideas.*

AOM's HQ team would be available to coordinate the logistics of setting up such a meeting (Michael McShane is cc'd on this email).

Thank you again for the effort you invested in the 5-year review. We hope the review has provided an opportunity to reflect on the state of the division, areas of strength, and opportunities to further enhance members' experiences. We value the activities and services the ONE Division provides for the Academy of Management and its members. We look forward to the division's continued development.

2022 Review of Organizations and Natural Environment (ONE) Division

STRENGTHS

The overall sentiment of the Division and Interest Group Relations (DIGR) Committee is that the ONE Division is a healthy community that is doing many things well. Their report was well organized, with clear future goals for each of their committees. Specific strengths include:

Strength #1 Strong Membership Growth and Satisfaction

- The membership increased 9.5% in the last 3-year period, with an increase of 21.2% in the non-US member segment; corresponding increase in the number of registrations and the number of reviewers for the annual meetings since 2017.
- Membership did not decline much during 2020 with a nice rebound in 2021.
- Members seem to identify strongly with ONE as 78% of survey respondents reported ONE as their primary division or on a par with another division. Survey responses also suggest a strong sense of community within the division.
- Overall increase in revenue, largely from AOM allocation based on growing membership.
- Over 80% of the survey respondents were satisfied with the division's communication, including its newsletter.
- Incorporating active involvement from students (e.g. Student team and its activities) who will likely stay connected to the division and move into additional leadership positions as their careers advance.

Strength #2 Structure and Leadership

- Team-oriented structure for accomplishing routine activities and implementing new ideas. This seems to allow a small division to accomplish quite bit and encourage member volunteering in a variety of ways.
- "In line with the AOM's strategic plan guidelines, we also introduced the new ONE Annual Chair and Team Transition Forms (See Appendices 3 and 4) to improve communications between the leaders and all team members." Clear representation of how past challenges (leadership transitions in post-Aug timeframe) have been mitigated by introducing governance process "transition forms"

Strength #3 Partnerships

- Partnerships with other divisions and orgs outside of AOM to pursue mission and goals.

Strength #4 Communication



- Advancing communication and highlighting members, particularly through social media outlets particular to their audience (i.e. Twitter).
- Their survey reflects good communications, and social media communications seem to be woven throughout many of their committee reports, so they are utilizing this broadly.

CHALLENGES

A few challenges and concerns were noted by members of the DIGR Committee, most of which were also identified in the Division report. They are:

Challenge #1 Clarifying Advocacy

- Ensure that goal 3 is not in conflict with AOM’s position of not taking stands: “Goal 3: ONE as the driving force and activist to make the AOM and academia more sustainable.”

Challenge #2 Overlap in goals among the ONE teams

- There is some overlap in future goals and activity between the 8 ONE Teams. For example, both the Comms and the Membership Teams plan to leverage social media to attract new members. Both the Student and the Internationalization Teams target the non-US markets for membership growth.

Challenge #3 Non-conference initiatives

- Limited evidence of building virtual initiatives outside the annual conference, such as Podcasts and Webinars, to enhance global reach, and developmental and networking opportunities for ONE members (the Program Team has a non-specific future goal in this regard).
- Low satisfaction with members and network communities and activities beyond the annual meeting.

Challenge #4 Sponsorship

- Limited sponsorship activity.

Challenge #5 Membership and member participation on some metrics

- Diversity and outreach/engagement issues: Executive members/practitioners' involvement, presence of under-represented regions in the program (e.g. Africa, Asia), nominations and elections.
- Approximately 70% of the respondents never or only once served as chair or discussant or volunteered in some capacity.
- Annual meeting registrants didn’t recover as well in 2021 as AOM overall. On the one hand the virtual format should be good for international faculty who aren’t able to travel but perhaps it was perceived that the scheduling would not accommodate international participation? Their submissions as % of membership was making strides (increasing quite a bit in 2020 when the submission deadline was before COVID shutdown), but that momentum seems lost for 2021.

Challenge #6 Communication

- Awards process need to be streamlined and communicated to ONE's membership.



- Ineffective communication of volunteer (e.g. becoming an officer) and award opportunities, including offering support, fee sponsorships and leveraging social media to stay in touch.
- 55% of survey respondents are only somewhat satisfied or not satisfied with Connect@AOM discussion.

OBSERVATIONS

Many of these concerns are mitigated by additional discussion, observations or strategic plans evident in the report, including:

Observation #1 Advocacy

- Detailed activity laddering to this goal 3 on pg. 23 provide context which does not raise concern about position of not taking stands.

Observation #2 Goals

- Some co-ordination efforts evident between the various Teams.
- All eight Teams list future goals, although these are not always specific, measurable and time bound.
- The Teams' future goals aim to address some of the above concerns. For example, a future goal of the Communication Team is to target practitioners and to strengthen ONE's Twitter presence.
- Seeking direction from membership about areas to focus on in next 5 years.
- Initiatives and future goals of each ONE teams are laid out in the report. The initiatives of the Internationalisation Team, the Teaching Team and the Student Team seem particularly important to move the Division forward (e.g. organize an annual symposium relevant for practitioners, symposium featuring a panel of the Teaching Award Recipients to offer best practices and tips, establish a new PDW fostering publications from around the world, actively promote diversity, offer and coordinate a teaching resources website, further develop and improve services to the Sustainability PhD Community).

Observation #3 Membership

- Many strong and doable goals to expand membership, especially international membership in different regions of the world.
- Plans are in place to cater more to underrepresented and non-US members who make up a large part of the ONE's membership and play a large role in the Division's growing numbers in terms of registrants, reviewers.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The DIGR Committee supports the strategic goals suggested by the Division leadership in their report. In an effort to help the ONE Division, we also offer these additional thoughts and recommendations for consideration:

Recommendation #1 Membership and member participation

- Keep engaging your student members (which take up a considerable part of your membership) and junior faculty (goal 5). It looks like the ONE Student Team has measures in place and laid out



future goals which cater to this specific group. It seems to be important for the Division to satisfy this group and keep them as engaged members in the future (and not lose them to other divisions).

- Measures could be taken to increase participation numbers (presentation and attendance) of your PDWs. As outlined by the authors new (annual) PDWs are being planned which can attract more members. Especially executive and practitioner members could be catered for in this category.

Recommendation #2 Leadership pipeline and leadership transitions

- Improve election and recruitment processes and provide more opportunities for (interested) members to influence the division and become leaders. This involves mentoring and networking opportunities, responsiveness and support from ONE officers - especially to attract future officers/leaders.
- Consider application of the leadership “transition forms” as successful case study for fellow DIGs where governance roles and communication of responsibilities are less clear.

Recommendation #3 Teaching community plus potential cross-division opportunity

- Strengthen the Teaching branch of your division. The ONE Teaching Team laid out future goals that can accomplish this.
- Future goal idea (pg. 8) has strong cross-member application: "Establish an annual Symposium at the AOM conference co-sponsored by ONE and multiple Divisions such as SIM, MED, MSR, STR, PNP, etc., featuring a panel of the Teaching Award Recipients. This panel symposium will offer best practices and tips for incorporating sustainability into teaching strategies." Consider incubator/piloting this experiment through Teaching and Learning Conference?

Recommendation #4 Committee goals coordination

- The committee goals are great. A small recommendation might be to map out some timelines that allow the division to look across the committee goals and prioritize a bit. It may be hard to do all these great and ambitious goals at once and some may need to be sequenced such that earlier priorities help ensure the success of later ones.

